

**COLUMBUS COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS
JOINT MEETING with COLUMBUS COUNTY SCHOOLS
BOARD of EDUCATION**

**Thursday, April 21, 2016
6:00 P.M.**

The Honorable Columbus County Commissioners met on the above stated date and at the above stated time at Southeastern Community College, T-Building, Room 120, at 4564 Chadbourn Highway, Whiteville, North Carolina, for the purpose of conducting a joint meeting with the Columbus County Schools Board of Education.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

Giles E. Byrd, **Chairman**
Charles T. McDowell, **Vice Chairman**
Amon E. McKenzie
James E. Prevatte
Ricky Bullard
Trent Burroughs (Arrived: 6:15 P.M.)

COMMISSIONER ABSENT:

P. Edwin Russ

PRESS:

Nicole Cartrette, **News Reporter**

OTHER in ATTENDANCE:

Dave Clinton, **Planner**

APPOINTEES PRESENT:

William S. Clark, **County Manager**
Mike Stephens, **County Attorney**
June B. Hall, **Clerk to Board**
Bobbie Faircloth, **Finance Officer**

BOARD of EDUCATION:

Norris Ebron, **Chairman**
Monte L. Herring, **Vice Chairman**
Barbara Yates
Worley T. Edwards
Junior Dew
Alan Faulk, **Superintendent**
Jonathan Williams, **Assistant Superintendent**
Terry Dudney, **Finance Officer**
Timmy Ward, **Maintenance Director**
William Phipps, **Board Attorney**

Agenda Item #1: MEETING CALLED to ORDER:

At 5:55 P.M., Chairman Giles E. Byrd called the meeting to order.

Agenda Item #2: INVOCATION:

Vice Chairman Charles T. McDowell welcomed everyone and delivered the invocation. Chairman Byrd stated that we would enjoy the dinner at this time.

Agenda Item #3: INTRODUCTION of ATTENDEES (NAME and TITLE):**A. Columbus County Board Members and Staff Members; and**

Each attendee stated their name and title.

B. Columbus County Schools Board of Education and Staff Members.

Each attendee stated their name and title.

Agenda Item #4: PURPOSE of JOINT MEETING: Chairman Giles E. Byrd

Chairman Byrd stated the main purpose of us meeting is to see what the needs are for the Columbus County Schools and what the Commissioners can do to help.

Agenda Item #5: RECOMMENDED PROCEDURE:

Chairman Byrd turned the floor over to Alan Faulk, Superintendent of Columbus County Schools.

PRESENTATION by ALAN FAULK:

FOCUS

- To promote greater mutual understanding of immediate and long-term budgetary issues and constraints affecting Columbus County Schools and Columbus County Commissioners.
- To assess the school instructional needs.
- To assess the school capital outlay needs.
- To develop and implement a joint plan for meeting these needs.

PERSONNEL

- 17 Teaching Positions:
Elementary Art Teachers
Elementary Physical Education Teachers
Career-Technical Education Teachers (Emergency Medical Technician)
Part-time College Promise Bus Drivers/Facilitators
- Approximately \$700,000.00

LOCAL SUPPLEMENTS

Certified	Non-Certified
5% to 6%	3.5% tp 4/5%

- Supplement Increase

1% Increase for Certified	-	Approximately \$290,000.00
1% Increase for Non-Certified	-	Approximately \$100,000.00

TECHNOLOGY

- Extend one-to-one Chromebook lease program from grades 6-8 to grades 6-12: \$275,000.00
- Communication expenses due to changes in ERATE funding: \$500,000.00

AGE of SCHOOLS

SCHOOL	YR ESTABLISHED	AGE
Acme Delco Elementary School	1951	65
Acme Delco Middle School	1926	90
Cerro Gordo Elementary School	1926	90
Chadbourn Elementary School	1952	64
Chadbourn Middle School	1948	67
East Columbus High School	1992	24
Evergreen Elementary School	1925	91
Guideway Elementary School	1978	38
Hallsboro Elementary School	1950	66
Hallsboro Middle School	1936	80
Nakina Middle School	1952	64

Old Dock Elementary School	1978	38
South Columbus High School	1992	24
Tabor City Elementary School	1927	89
Tabor City Middle School	1954	62
Whiteville City High School	1965	51
Williams Township School	2006	10

TOTAL COST for WORK NEEDED

SCHOOL	COST
Acme Delco Elementary	\$255,675.00
Chadbourn Elementary	\$404,225.00
Guideway	\$391,988.00
Hallsboro/Artesia Elementary	\$1,440,350.00
Nakina Middle	\$224,200.00
Old Dock Elementary	\$1,250,000.00
East Columbus	\$547,000.00
South Columbus	\$372,000.00
West Columbus	\$4,031,000.00
Williams Township	\$218,362.00
Administration Building	\$407,034.00
School Bus Garage	\$79,000.00
Plant Operations	\$77,000.00

Agenda Item #6: DISCUSSION:

Alan Faulk, Superintendent of Columbus County Schools, turned the floor over to David Clinton, Planner with Szostak, for the Columbus County Schools Long Range Plan for Campuses and Facilities. Mr. Clinton presented the following.

SZOSTAK DESIGN and EDUCATION LEADERSHIP for SUCCESS, LLC

Goals of this Report:

- 1. Improve Student Outcomes**
 The average student population at the schools is less than 340. Virtually no school in the state is constructed to serve less than 400 students, with average elementary schools serving 500 to 700 students. Based on Average Daily Membership (ADM), alone, the system is not operating efficiently. Under utilization severely limits available funds to improve each campus, this severely limiting the ability to improve learning environments.
- 2. Significantly Reduce Cost of Operations**
 Eleven (11) of the eighteen (18) campuses are over sixty (60) years old and seven (7) of those were constructed before 1950. Numerous buildings are of wood construction that is noticeably failing. None of those eleven (11) campuses have ADA Compliant Toilet Rooms and many of the Toilet Rooms are entered only by going outside of the building. The extent of remediation required to upgrade buildings like these will tend to make renovation a costly choice.

632

In order to accomplish the first to goals we are recommending that seven (7) schools be closed, one (1) be renewed and two (2) new schools be constructed.

3. For new and existing campuses, going forward: Maintain Reasonable Geographic Distribution of Facilities.

General Maintenance Costs for Schools

2015-2016 Maintenance Costs*	\$712,792
Maintenance Costs for 7 Schools recommending for closing**	\$406,101
Maintenance Costs for Remaining 11 schools	\$306,691

*Does not include Old Dock School

**Includes Cerro Gordo

Specific Condition Issues at Each Facility

SPECIFIC CONDITION ISSUES	FACILITY
<p><u>Roof, Wall and Floor Structures</u> \$11,000,000 for 7 schools to be closed. \$3,000,000 for 11 others</p>	Evergreen, Cerro Gordo, Tabor City Elementary, Tabor City Middle
<p><u>Accessibility for Handicapped Persons</u> Conditions are typical of all facilities built before 1980</p>	Tabor City Middle, Tabor City Elementary, Evergreen
<p><u>Toilet Facilities</u> Conditions are typical of all facilities built before 1980. Renovation costs - \$2,900,000 for 7 schools to be closed; \$2,150,000 for the other 11 schools.</p>	Tabor City Elementary, Hallsboro Middle, Evergreen
<p><u>Roofing</u> \$2,700,000 for school to be closed; \$5,000,000 for the other schools.</p>	Tabor City Elementary, Cerro Gordo, Evergreen, Acme Delco Middle, Hallsboro Middle, Chadbourn Middle
<p><u>Wall Openings - no energy efficiency; will not stand up to high winds</u> \$3,354,000 for the 7 schools to be closed; \$3,050,000 for the other 11 schools.</p>	Tabor City Elementary, Tabor City Middle, Cerro Gordo, Acme Delco Middle, Hallsboro Middle, Evergreen, Chadbourn Middle
<p><u>Fire Safety: Alarm System; Area Separation</u> Should include: central fire alarm, visible/audible horn strobes, emergency lighting on battery. Typical of ALL campuses except Old Dock and Williams Township - no system exists. \$510,000 for the 7 schools to be closed; \$440,000 for the other 11 schools.</p>	Evergreen, Tabor City Elementary
<p><u>Site Issues</u> Walkway cover condition and drainage are universal problems across the system. \$666,000 for the 7 schools to be closed; \$440,000 for the other 11 schools.</p>	Hallsboro Middle, Acme Delco Middle, Evergreen, Cerro Gordo, Tabor City Elementary, Chadbourn Middle

SPECIFIC CONDITION ISSUES	FACILITY
<p>Electrical Issues Mechanical and Electrical - \$6,069,000 for the 7 schools to be closed; \$13,745,000 for the other 11 schools. Life expectancy for electrical equipment is 15 to 20 years.</p>	Evergreen, Tabor City Elementary, Cerro Gordo

Repair Needs, Utility Cost and Occupancy at Each Facility

SCHOOL	AGE OF OLDEST STRUCTURE	CURRENT TOTAL ADM	% OF CAMPUS THAT NEEDS MAJOR REPAIRS OR REPLACEMENT	ENERGY COST PER STUDENT
Acme-Delco Middle	1926	146	70%	\$459.12
Chadbourn Middle	1949	119	80%	\$486.32
Evergreen PreK - 8	1924	275	100%	\$201.59
Hallsboro Middle	1938	213	75%	\$457.24
Tabor City Elementary	1926	418	90%	\$264.83
Tabor City Middle	1952	179	75%	\$377.28
CCCA	1926	296	65%	\$119.88

North Carolina Facilities Cost Index:

What percent of a building’s value is the cost to repair it?

- Good Condition - < 5%
- Fair Condition is 5% to 10%
- Poor Condition is 10% to 30%
- Critical Condition is over 30%

9 of the campuses are over 30%
 7 of the campuses are 10% to 30%

The average cost to repair your campuses is 42%.

Total Average Daily Membership:	-	6,193
Classroom Capacity	-	11,478
Average Classroom Utilization	-	54%
Major Repair Needs:	-	\$150,824,878
Annual Energy Costs:	-	\$1,594,225
Average Energy Costs Per Square Foot:	-	\$1.29
Average Energy Costs Per Student:	-	\$289
-Acme Delco Middle		\$459
-Chadbourn Middle	-	\$486
-Evergreen and Hallsboro Middle, each	-	\$457
-Tabor City Middle	-	\$377

Cost to Repair Each Facility that We recommend Closing:

These seven (7) schools represent 39% of the campuses and 61% of the Repair and Replacement

634

Cost: \$91,021,328
 Repair Costs per Student: \$55,910

Costs to Repair Each Remaining Facility:
Consolidate and Replace the Others

Costs for Replacement schools: - \$70,455,000
 Costs for remaining schools: - \$59,083,550

Repair Needs, Utility Costs, Occupancy at Remaining Facilities:

Total Average Daily Membership: 6,193
 Classroom Capacity (Before): 11,478 (After): 8,253
 Classroom Utilization (Before): 54% (After): 75%
 Major Repair Needs (Before): 42% (After): 16%
 Energy Costs Reduced 23%
 Building Area to be Maintained Reduced 27%
 Energy Costs per Square Foot Reduced 13%
 Energy Costs Per Student Reduced 27%

Cost of Doing Nothing:

SCHOOL	CONSTRUC COST IN 2017	1 YEAR INFLATION	2 YEARS INFLATION	3 YEARS INFLATION
Cerro Gordo PreK - 8	\$25,410,000	\$26,172,300	\$26,934,600	\$27,696,900
Tabor City Pre-K - 8	\$25,480,000	\$26,244,400	\$27,008,800	\$26,773,200
East Columbus Middle School	\$19,565,000	\$20,151,950	\$20,738,900	\$21,325,850
Total School Construction Cost	\$70,455,000	\$72,568,650	\$74,682,300	\$76,795,950
Annual Energy and Maintenance Costs for above-listed Existing Facilities		\$977,268	\$1,954,536	\$2,931,804
Total Costs for Delay		\$73,545,918	\$76,636,836	\$79,727,754
% Cost Increase for Delay		4.20%	8.8%	11.20%
\$ Costs for Delay		\$3,090,918	\$6,181,836	\$9,272,754

The cost of borrowing is cheaper than keeping these buildings - Even before the cost of repairing them is considered.

COMMENTS / DISCUSSION:

1. There will be \$1 million savings per year;
2. The savings does not include personnel, it includes energy and regular maintenance;
3. A thirty (30) year loan, at 2.85%, will be a \$3.4 million payment per year;
4. A forty (40) year loan, at 2.85% will be a \$3 million payment per year; **and**
5. This is a \$70 million dollar project.

Agenda Item #7: ADJOURNMENT:

At 7:41 P.M., Chairman Byrd stated the joint meeting was closed.

APPROVED:

JUNE B. HALL, Clerk to Board

GILES E. BYRD, Chairman